

Prosiding Seminar Nasional Inovasi pendidikan dan Pembelajaran Fakultas Pendidikan Bahasa dan Seni IKIP PGRI Bojonegoro Tema "Inovasi pendidikan dan Pembelajaran di era digital untuk Pengalaman Belajar Imersif"



Comparison of Using Audiovisual Media and Textbook Media In Improving Students Reading Comprehension

Rahma Karida¹, Refi Ranto Rozak², Fitri Nurdianingsih³ ^{1,2,3}Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris, Indonesia <u>rahmakarida@ikippgribojonegoro.ac.id</u>¹, <u>refi.ranto@ikippgribojonegoro.ac.id</u>², <u>fitri.nurdianingsih@ikippgribojonegoro.ac.id</u>³

Absract - This study investigates the comparative effectiveness of audiovisual media and traditional textbook-based instruction in enhancing students' reading comprehension. The main objective is to determine whether audiovisual media leads to a more significant improvement in students' understanding of English texts. A quantitative experimental research design was employed involving 60 eighth-grade students from SMP Ar-Rahmat, who were equally divided into a control group (textbook-based instruction) and an experimental group (audiovisual media-based instruction). Both groups were given pre-test and post-test assessments to measure changes in reading comprehension. The findings revealed that the experimental group using audiovisual media showed a 40.32% increase in their reading comprehension scores, while the control group using textbooks showed only a 30% increase. This 10.32% difference highlights the greater effectiveness of audiovisual media in supporting reading comprehension. The use of audiovisual content not only facilitated better understanding of the material but also increased student engagement and motivation during the learning process. These results suggest that audiovisual media can be a powerful instructional tool and a more effective alternative to textbooks in English language learning, especially for developing reading comprehension at the secondary school level.

Keywords: audiovisual media, textbook, reading comprehension, experimental study, secondary education

Absrak-Penelitian ini mengkaji efektivitas media audiovisual dibandingkan dengan pembelajaran berbasis buku teks tradisional dalam meningkatkan kemampuan membaca pemahaman siswa. Tujuan utama dari penelitian ini adalah untuk mengetahui apakah media audiovisual memberikan peningkatan yang lebih signifikan terhadap pemahaman teks berbahasa Inggris. Desain penelitian yang digunakan adalah eksperimen kuantitatif dengan melibatkan 60 siswa kelas VIII SMP Ar-Rahmat yang dibagi secara merata ke dalam dua kelompok: kelompok kontrol (menggunakan buku teks) dan kelompok eksperimen (menggunakan media audiovisual). Kedua kelompok diberikan pre-test dan post-test untuk mengukur perkembangan kemampuan membaca pemahaman mereka. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa kelompok yang menggunakan media audiovisual mengalami peningkatan skor sebesar 40,32%, sedangkan kelompok yang menggunakan buku teks hanya mengalami peningkatan sebesar 30%. Perbedaan sebesar 10,32% ini menunjukkan bahwa media audiovisual lebih efektif dalam meningkatkan pemahaman bacaan siswa. Selain itu, penggunaan media audiovisual juga meningkatkan keterlibatan dan motivasi siswa selama proses pembelajaran. Temuan ini mengindikasikan bahwa media audiovisual dapat menjadi alat pembelajaran yang lebih efektif dan menarik dibandingkan buku teks dalam pembelajaran bahasa Inggris, khususnya dalam keterampilan membaca pemahaman di jenjang sekolah menengah pertama.

Kata Kunci: media audiovisual, buku teks, membaca pemahaman, studi eksperimen, pendidikan menengah

INTRODUCTION

Local research conducted within IKIP PGRI Bojonegoro reinforces the importance of innovative media and teaching methods in addressing the dynamic challenges of English language learning. Sagita et al. (2023) revealed that students often face difficulties in understanding listening materials due to monotonous delivery and lack of contextual support. This finding underscores the necessity of incorporating audiovisual elements to make listening tasks more interactive and engaging. Similarly, Ermawati et al. (2022) stressed the urgency of adopting adaptive, technology-based learning designs in the post-pandemic educational landscape. Their study highlighted the role of digital media – particularly video content – as a means to bridge pedagogical gaps caused by remote or hybrid learning systems.

In the domain of reading comprehension, Rahmawati et al. (2021) found that the integration of online digital modules significantly boosts students' motivation to read, suggesting that digital interventions are effective not only in enhancing cognitive outcomes but also in sustaining learner interest. Further, the role of the teacher remains pivotal. As Nurdianingsih (2021) indicated, teaching strategies that align with students' needs and emotional states directly influence learning success. This is particularly relevant when dealing with anxiety, disengagement, or limited prior knowledge. Supporting this, Nurdianingsih et al. (2023) emphasized that varied media use in classroom settings—especially in interpretive reading—can stimulate interaction and foster deeper comprehension, reflecting the multifaceted benefits of multimedia engagement.

A growing body of literature also points to psychological factors affecting reading performance. Vernanda (2024), in her dissertation, conducted a thorough analysis of first-year students' anxiety in reading classes and found that high anxiety levels could hinder comprehension, reduce participation, and foster negative attitudes toward reading activities. This aligns with findings from Vernanda, Matin, and Rahmawati (2024), who observed that the use of supportive audiovisual materials can mitigate anxiety, improve student confidence, and create a more inclusive learning environment. This is especially relevant in beginner-level classrooms where students are still adjusting to academic reading in a foreign language.

Complementing these perspectives, Primasari, Prastiwi, and Rahmawati (2022) explored effective strategies for teaching reading in EFL classrooms, concluding that strategic use of diverse media enhances students' engagement and facilitates better comprehension. Meanwhile, Hasanudin et al. (2022) demonstrated innovative ways to create digital reading materials using Kodular—an accessible platform for educators—which is particularly useful for adapting reading content for younger or elementary-level learners. Their research supports the notion that technology-enhanced materials not only improve content delivery but also provide opportunities for differentiated instruction.

These local studies provide compelling evidence that the use of audiovisual media is both theoretically grounded and practically effective. From a pedagogical standpoint, reading comprehension is a foundational skill in English language acquisition that requires more than just exposure to printed text. It necessitates the development of inferencing, summarizing, and contextualizing abilities—all of which can be supported through visual and auditory stimuli. Kartika et al. (2023) further affirmed that audiovisual media improves listening and comprehension by providing concrete, contextual visuals and sounds that mirror real-life communication. Khalili et al. (2021) corroborated these findings by highlighting the positive effect of audiovisual tools on students' motivation and learning attitudes, particularly in language classrooms where learner engagement is often a challenge.

In addition, Singh and Alexander (2022) conducted comparative studies on comprehension outcomes across different media formats and concluded that digital media—such as audiobooks and videos—can be equally or more effective than traditional print materials, depending on the learner's individual preferences and the context of instruction. Rieni (2022) added a unique angle by establishing a positive correlation between students' habits of watching YouTube videos and their English listening proficiency, suggesting that informal audiovisual exposure also contributes significantly to language acquisition.

Taken together, these studies collectively suggest that audiovisual media not only enhances understanding of listening and reading materials but also addresses affective barriers such as anxiety, boredom, and low motivation. These insights are particularly important when teaching junior high school students who are at a developmental stage where attention span, emotional sensitivity, and media familiarity play a crucial role in shaping their learning experience.

Therefore, based on both theoretical frameworks and empirical evidence from local and international sources, this study seeks to compare the effectiveness of using audiovisual media versus textbook media in improving students' reading comprehension at SMP Ar-Rahmat. The results are expected to provide practical recommendations for language teachers and curriculum developers in designing more inclusive, engaging, and effective reading instruction strategies.

RESEARCH METHOD

This study employed a quantitative approach with an experimental design. The sample consisted of 60 students from SMP Ar-Rahmat divided into two groups: a control class using textbook media, and an experimental class using audiovisual media. The data collection technique involved reading tests conducted before and after the treatment. The data were analyzed using descriptive and inferential statistics to determine the significance of the difference in outcomes between the two groups.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The results of the study revealed a significant difference in reading comprehension improvement between students taught using audiovisual media and those taught using textbook-based instruction. As illustrated in Table 1, the audiovisual class showed a greater improvement of 25 points, increasing from a pretest average of 62 to a post-test average of 87. This represents a 40.32% increase. In

contrast, the textbook class improved by 18 points, from 60 to 78, which is equivalent to a 30% increase. These results clearly indicate that audiovisual media substantially and effectively impacted students' reading comprehension.

Group	Pre-Test Score	Post-Test Score	Score Increase	Percentage Increase
Textbook Class	60	78	+18	30.00%
Audiovisua 1 Class	62	87	+25	40.32%

 Tabel 1. Comparison of Pre-Test and Post-Test Scores

The higher percentage gain in the audiovisual class supports the idea that audiovisual media provides a more dynamic and engaging learning experience. The integration of sound and visual stimuli helps students focus more effectively, facilitates better retention of information, and improves overall comprehension. Compared to static textbook-based learning, audiovisual content enables learners to process information through multiple sensory channels, which deepens understanding and makes abstract concepts easier to grasp.

These findings align with the results of previous studies. Mashudi et al. (2021) found that audiovisual media enhanced students' learning outcomes in culinary education, while Khumaedi et al. (2021) demonstrated that audiovisual-based instruction in technical drawing improved concept understanding more effectively than conventional methods. Moreover, Khalil et al. (2024) highlighted the effectiveness of audiovisual-based English songs in improving listening skills, which also involved multimodal learning benefits similar to those observed in the present study.

Taken together, these results reinforce the conclusion that audiovisual media is not only effective in practical or skill-based subjects but also plays a vital role in improving language skills, particularly reading comprehension. As students today are increasingly accustomed to digital environments, incorporating audiovisual materials into reading instruction offers a relevant and impactful pedagogical strategy.

In summary, the study concludes that audiovisual media leads to a significantly higher improvement in students' reading comprehension compared to textbook-based methods. This suggests that educators should consider integrating more audiovisual materials into the classroom to optimize student learning outcomes.

CONCLUSION

This study concluded that the use of audiovisual media is significantly more effective than textbook-based instruction in improving students' reading comprehension. The data showed that students taught with audiovisual materials experienced a 25-point or 40.32% increase in their reading comprehension scores, while those in the textbook group showed only an 18-point or 30% increase. This

substantial difference highlights the powerful role that audiovisual elements play in enhancing student engagement, comprehension, and retention of reading material.

The integration of visual and auditory components in the learning process provides a more interactive and stimulating environment, which is especially beneficial for students who struggle with conventional reading methods. These findings are in line with previous studies that support the effectiveness of audiovisual media across various subjects, including language learning.

Based on these results, it is recommended that educators integrate audiovisual resources into reading instruction to maximize learning outcomes. Audiovisual media should be viewed not merely as supplementary tools, but as essential components of modern teaching strategies, particularly in contexts where enhancing comprehension is a key instructional goal.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors would like to express their sincere gratitude to SMP Ar-Rahmat for granting permission to conduct this research. Special thanks are also extended to the academic advisors, Refi Ranto Rozak and Fitri Nurdianingsih, as well as the committee of the national seminar for their continuous support and guidance. Appreciation is likewise given to the students who participated and contributed to the success of this study.

REFERENCES

- Ermawati, S., Prastiwi, C. H. W., & Rozak, R. R. (2022). Post-pandemic learning design for English Study Program. In *Proceeding International Conference on Digital Education and Social Science* (Vol. 1, No. 1, pp. 211-217). https://prosiding.appipgri.id/index.php/icdess/article/view/29.
- Nurdianingsih, F. (2021). Teachers' strategies in teaching reading comprehension. *PROJECT (Professional Journal of English Education),* 4(2), 285-289. <u>https://doi.org/10.22460/project.v4i2.p285-289</u>.
- Nurdianingsih, F., Ardiana, S. N. F., & Dani, D. (2023). Lecturer's and Students' Talk in the Classroom Interaction of Interpretive Reading Class. *PROJECT* (*Professional Journal of English Education*), 6(4), 811-819.
- Rahmawati, O. I., Nurdianingsih, F., & Fitrianingsih, A. (2021). Motivating Students to Read Uses Online Digital Module. *Prosiding Nasional Pendidikan: LPPM IKIP PGRI Bojonegoro*, 2(1), 236-240. https://prosiding.ikippgribojonegoro.ac.id/index.php/Prosiding/article/view/1167.
- Sagita, B. F. P., Rozak, R. R., & Tritanawati, M. R. (2023, July). Difficulties faced by students' at second semester of English Education Study Program of IKIP PGRI Bojonegoro in listening comprehension academic year 2022/2023. In *Prosiding Seminar Nasional Daring: Pendidikan Bahasa dan Sastra Indonesia* (Vol. 3, No. 1, pp. 761-769). https://prosiding.ikippgribojonegoro.ac.id/index.php/SPBSI/article/view/20

78.

- Bajrami, L., & Ismaili, M. (2016). The role of video materials in EFL classrooms. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 232, 502-506. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2016.10.068</u>.
- Hasanudin, C., Fitrianingsih, A., Utomo, D. N. P., & Baihaqi, M. A. R. (2022, August). Strategies to create digital learning materials of early reading for elementary school students using kodular. In *Proceedings International Conference on Education Innovation and Social Science* (pp. 34-47). <u>https://proceedings.ums.ac.id/iceiss/article/view/959</u>.
- Hidayati, F. N., Nurdianingsih, F., & Rozak, R. R. (2024, June). Analyzing slang usage in informal English communication among 6[^] th semester English Education Student in IKIP PGRI Bojonegoro. In Seminar Nasional dan Gelar Karya Produk Hasil Pembelajaran (Vol. 2, No. 1, pp. 832-836). https://prosiding.ikippgribojonegoro.ac.id/index.php/SNGK/article/view/2 506.
- Kartika, D., Siahaan, S., Herman, H., Rumapea, E. L., & Silalahi, T. F. (2023). Implementation of audio-visual teaching media in improving students' listening comprehension: A case on teaching method. *Journal of English Language and Education*, 8(2), 86-96. <u>https://doi.org/10.31004/jele.v8i2.428</u>.
- Khalili, A., Zeinolabedini, M., Poorebrahim, F., & Sattarpour, S. (2021). The role of audio-visual aids in general English Classes at Medical University: Reading comprehension, attitude, and motivation. *Journal of English Language Teaching* and Learning, 13(27), 215-238. <u>https://doi.org/10.22034/elt.2021.44787.2354</u>.
- Khalil, M., Zaiturrahmi, Z., & Ramlan, R. (2024). The efficacy of english song on students' listening by using audio visual. JUREE: The Journal of English Education, 1(1). http://journal.unigha.ac.id/index.php/JUREE/article/view/2268.
- Khumaedi, M., Widjanarko, D., Setiadi, R., & Setiyawan, A. (2021). Evaluating the Impact of Audio-Visual Media on Learning Outcomes of Drawing Orthographic Projections. *International Journal of Education and Practice*, 9(3), 613-624. <u>https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1328725</u>.
- Mashudi, M., Komariah, K., & Irvan, M. (2021). The use of audio-visual media in improving Culinary students learning outcomes in Chicken Carcass material. Jurnal Pendidikan Vokasi, 11(1), 14-23. <u>https://scholarhub.uny.ac.id/jpv/vol11/iss1/2/</u>.
- Primasari, R. N., Prastiwi, C. H. W., & Rahmawati, O. I. (2022, June). Strategies for teaching reading in efl classroom. In *English Language and Literature International Conference (ELLiC) Proceedings* (Vol. 5, pp. 509-515).
- Rieni, H. (2022). The correlation between students' habit in watching YouTube. EDUTAMA. <u>https://repository.ikippgribojonegoro.ac.id/2035/</u>.

- Singh, A., & Alexander, P. A. (2022). Audiobooks, print, and comprehension: What we know and what we need to know. Educational Psychology Review, 34(2), 677-715. <u>https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10648-021-09653-2</u>.
- Vernanda, L. (2024). An analysis of first year students'anxiety in reading class at Education Department of IKIP PGRI Bojonegoro (Doctoral dissertation, IKIP PGRI Bojonegoro).
- Vernanda, L., Matin, M. F., & Rahmawati, O. I. (2024, June). An analysis of students' anxiety in reading english of the first semester students English Education Study Program of IKIP PGRI Bojonegoro. In Seminar Nasional dan Gelar Karya Produk Hasil Pembelajaran (Vol. 2, No. 1, pp. 1982-1989). <u>https://prosiding.ikippgribojonegoro.ac.id/index.php/SNGK/article/view/2</u> <u>721</u>.